

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE**

Open Society Justice Initiative v. Central Intelligence Agency et al  
Assigned to: Judge Paul A. Engelmayer  
Related Case: 1:19-cv-01329-PAE  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 01/09/2019  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Open Society Justice Initiative**

represented by **Amrit Singh**  
Open Society Justice Initiative  
224 W. 57th St  
New York, NY 10019  
212-548-0660  
Fax: 212-548-4662  
Email: [amrit.singh@opensocietyfoundations.org](mailto:amrit.singh@opensocietyfoundations.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**David James Sandler**  
Debevoise & Plimpton LLP  
919 Third Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
(212)-909-6687  
Email: [dsandler@debevoise.com](mailto:dsandler@debevoise.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Catherine M. Amirfar**  
Debevoise & Plimpton, LLP (NYC)  
919 Third Avenue, 3rd Floor  
New York, NY 10022  
(212)-909-6398  
Fax: (212)-909-6836  
Email: [camirfar@debevoise.com](mailto:camirfar@debevoise.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**Central Intelligence Agency**

represented by **David Stuart Jones**  
U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (86 Chambers St.)  
86 Chambers Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2200  
Fax: 212-637-2686  
Email: [david.jones6@usdoj.gov](mailto:david.jones6@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Natasha Waglow Teleanu**  
United States Attorney's Office, SDNY  
86 Chambers Street, 3rd fl.  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2528  
Fax: 212-637-2786  
Email: [natasha.teleanu@usdoj.gov](mailto:natasha.teleanu@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Peter Max Aronoff**  
United States Attorney's Office for the  
SDNY  
86 Chambers Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2697  
Fax: 212-637-2686  
Email: [peter.aronoff@usdoj.gov](mailto:peter.aronoff@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Department of Defense**

represented by **David Stuart Jones**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Natasha Waglow Teleanu**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Peter Max Aronoff**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**National Security Agency**

represented by **David Stuart Jones**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Natasha Waglow Teleanu**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Peter Max Aronoff**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Office of the Director of National  
Intelligence**

represented by **David Stuart Jones**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Natasha Waglow Teleanu**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Peter Max Aronoff**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Department of Justice**

**Defendant****Department of State**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
01/09/2019	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC-16163411) Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Plaintiffs FOIA requests)(Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>3</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST As To – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to Central Intelligence Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) Modified on 1/10/2019 (pne). (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>4</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST As To – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to Department of Defense, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) Modified on 1/10/2019 (pne). (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>5</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST As To – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to National Security Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) Modified on 1/10/2019 (pne). (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>6</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – SUMMONS REQUEST As To – REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS</b> as to Office of the Director of National Intelligence, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) Modified on 1/10/2019 (pne). (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/09/2019	<u>7</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Identifying Other Affiliate Open Society Institute for Open Society Justice Initiative. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative.(Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/09/2019)
01/10/2019		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge John G. Koeltl. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php</a> . (pne) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019		Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php</a> . (pne) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019		Case Designated ECF. (pne) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. Notice to Attorney Catherine M. Amirfar to RE–FILE Document No. <u>3</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>4</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>5</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>6</u> Request for Issuance of Summons,. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): the name of the party for whom the summons is being requested must be the first name that appears in the 'To' field on the summons request PDF; any name that follows the name of the party to be served must include 'c/o', 'via', or 'attn'; party name in the 'To' field must exactly match party name as it appears on pleading caption. Re–file the document using the event type Request for Issuance of Summons found under the event list Service of Process – select the correct filer/filers – and attach the correct summons form PDF. (pne)</b> (Entered: 01/10/2019)

01/10/2019	<u>8</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Central Intelligence Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019	<u>9</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Department of Defense, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019	<u>10</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to National Security Agency, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019	<u>11</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Office of the Director of National Intelligence, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/10/2019	<u>12</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Amrit Singh on behalf of Open Society Justice Initiative. (Singh, Amrit) (Entered: 01/10/2019)
01/11/2019	<u>13</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Central Intelligence Agency. (dnh) (Entered: 01/11/2019)
01/11/2019	<u>14</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Department of Defense. (dnh) (Entered: 01/11/2019)
01/11/2019	<u>15</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to National Security Agency. (dnh) (Entered: 01/11/2019)
01/11/2019	<u>16</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Office of the Director of National Intelligence. (dnh) (Entered: 01/11/2019)
01/16/2019		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. Judge John G. Koeltl is no longer assigned to the case. (bcu) (Entered: 01/16/2019)
01/18/2019	<u>17</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>tolling answer deadline until 30 days from first business day following Justice Department funding restoration</i> addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from David S. Jones dated January 18, 2019. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit standing order staying certain civil cases affected by lapse in appropriations)(Jones, David) (Entered: 01/18/2019)
01/18/2019	<u>18</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Amrit Singh on behalf of Open Society Justice Initiative. New Address: Open Society Justice Initiative, 224 W. 57th St, New York, New York, 10019, 2125480660. (Singh, Amrit) (Entered: 01/18/2019)
01/18/2019	<u>19</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Central Intelligence Agency served on 1/14/2019, answer due 2/4/2019; Department of Defense served on 1/14/2019, answer due 2/4/2019; National Security Agency served on 1/14/2019, answer due 2/4/2019; Office of the Director of National Intelligence served on 1/14/2019, answer due 2/4/2019. Service was accepted by Lisa Ahearn, Civil Clerk Supervisor. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 01/18/2019)
01/22/2019	<u>20</u>	ORDER granting <u>17</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 1/22/2019) (js) (Entered: 01/22/2019)
02/14/2019	<u>21</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Natasha Waglow Teleanu on behalf of Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence. (Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 02/14/2019)
02/22/2019	<u>22</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION to Consolidate Cases 19–cv–1329 <i>and this action given identical FOIA requests</i> addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Peter Aronoff dated 2/22/2019., CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re: <u>1</u> Complaint, <i>to set a uniform answer date of March 18, 2019 for all defendants</i> addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Peter Aronoff dated 2/22/2019. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence.(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 02/22/2019)

02/27/2019	<u>23</u>	ORDER granting (22) Letter Motion to Consolidate Cases; granting (22) Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer in case 1:19-cv-00234-PAE. Granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 2/27/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE (anc) Modified on 2/27/2019 (anc). (Entered: 02/27/2019)
02/27/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Central Intelligence Agency answer due 3/18/2019; Department of Defense answer due 3/18/2019; Department of Justice answer due 3/18/2019; Department of State answer due 3/18/2019; National Security Agency answer due 3/18/2019; Office of the Director of National Intelligence answer due 3/18/2019. (anc) (Entered: 02/27/2019)
03/18/2019	<u>24</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence.(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 03/18/2019)
03/19/2019	<u>25</u>	NOTICE OF INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Conference set for 4/19/2019 at 02:30 PM in Courtroom 1305, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer; and as further set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 3/19/2019) (anc) (Entered: 03/22/2019)
04/15/2019	<u>26</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE OF PRO BONO COUNSEL by David James Sandler on behalf of Open Society Justice Initiative Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Sandler, David) (Entered: 04/15/2019)
04/15/2019	<u>27</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Natasha W. Teleanu dated 4/15/2019 re: Initial Conference. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Teleanu, Natasha) (Entered: 04/15/2019)
04/18/2019	<u>28</u>	CONSENT LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Peter Aronoff dated 4/18/2019 re: requesting initial conference be moved to 1pm on 4/19/2019. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 04/18/2019)
04/18/2019	<u>29</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: (28 in 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 17 in 1:19-cv-01329-PAE) Letter, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The Court hereby adjourns this conference to noon on Friday, April 19, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Initial Conference set for 4/19/2019 at 12:00 PM before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer.) (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 4/18/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 04/18/2019)
04/22/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 4/22/2019. Amrit Singh & David Sandler present for Plaintiff. Natasha Teleanu & Peter Aronoff present for Defendants. Court reporter present. (ajs) (Entered: 04/22/2019)
04/23/2019	<u>30</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: The above-captioned actions having been consolidated, see ECF No. 23 in 19 Civ. 234, absent further order of the Court, all filings in these matters going forward shall be made under the docket number 19 Civ. 234. The parties shall negotiate in good faith to narrow the scope of the search or exclude categories of non-substantive records identified by Defendants. On April 26, 2019, and every Friday thereafter until directed by the Court, the Parties shall update the Court in a joint letter on the status of discussions between the Parties and Defendants' responses to Plaintiffs Requests; and as further set forth herein. Status Conference set for 6/4/2019 at 03:30 PM in Courtroom 1305, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 4/22/2019) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(anc) (Entered: 04/23/2019)

04/24/2019	<u>31</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 4/19/2019 before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Kelly Surina, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 5/15/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/28/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/23/2019.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
04/24/2019	<u>32</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 4/19/19 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>33</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Central Intelligence Agency served on 1/16/2019, answer due 3/18/2019. Service was made by certified mail. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>34</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Service was made by certified mail and Also on the U. S. Attorney General. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>35</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. National Security Agency served on 1/16/2019, answer due 3/18/2019. Service was made by certified mail. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>36</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Office of the Director of National Intelligence served on 1/16/2019, answer due 3/18/2019. Service was made by certified mail. Document filed by Open Society Justice Initiative. (Amirfar, Catherine) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>37</u>	STATUS REPORT. ( <i>joint</i> ) Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency, Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Department of Justice, Department of State.Filed In Associated Cases: 1:19-cv-00234-PAE, 1:19-cv-01329-PAE(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 04/26/2019)